



Enhancing Organizational Integrity in Pakistan: Exploring the Contribution of Human Resource Management Practices in Mitigating Malpractices

Eruj Wajidi

Lecturer, Institute of Health and Business Management, Jinnah Sindh Medical University, Karachi
erujwajidi@hotmail.com

Syed Shabib-ul-Hasan

Vice Chancellor, Hamdard University, Karachi
huvc@hamdard.edu.pk

Abstract

Malpractices is one of the problems in HR management mostly in underdeveloped or developing countries like Pakistan. Malpractices affect the health and prosperity of an organization which indirectly affects the national interest of the country. Pakistan's economic growth is one the lowest in the region. It is realized that malpractices in majority of functional operation be it private or public is one of the critical reasons for Pakistan's low growth. Since widely malpractices in private and public organizations affect the economic growth of the country, this study will help to uncover the malpractices, their common factors responsible for malpractices and the solution of the problem. This study was done on the private and public organizations of Pakistan. Countries having similar problems may also benefit from the study.

Keywords: *Malpractices, HRM Practices, Malpractices in organization, Trustworthiness, Intellectual Property*



Introduction

Human resource management (HRM) is the management of employees in any organization. It should basically merit based, tenure of employment or experience based and through a standardized frame work of pay and conditions (World Bank 2013). The extent and range of human resource extends ahead of just selection and termination of staff. HR managers sets the tone of moral practices in a corporation, hence their righteous beliefs and values are utmost important. Human resource can impact the performance, subsistence and behavior of worker in the corporation (Itoo, 2019). HR plays a pivotal role in building organizational citizenship, corporate norms and morals.

Corruption or malpractices in organizations are neither new nor limited to type or size of the organization. Malpractices are exhibition of violation of principles and justifiable actions like persecute and badger. Malpractices in public enterprises bring profitability setbacks and impact the corporation both inside and outside. Disengagement and deters performance of staff, dents associations between coworkers and impacts corporation culture and traditions (Gatchalian, 2021). Moreover it hampers the image of the company in the eyes and view of clients. Another setback is turnover of competent staff. A rancid work climate results in loss of resources, low organizational performance, lack of new ideas and loss of competitive edge. Dispute between workers and pressure to violate the laws are common reasons for malpractice. Malpractices affect organizational performance and profitability to a great extent damaging its health and environment. Therefore it must be curbed or eliminated. Shaan (2019) identified the malpractices in the following functions of an organization: Workers duties, Monetary Remunerations and benefits, Performance Assessment, Confidentiality problems, Color, Background or Disability, Safety, Security and Health, Employment Problems, Restructuring and Layoffs.

Literature Review

Absenteeism and other Malpractices

Worker absenteeism is considered as one of the main reasons of dropping of productivity and organizational performance in the public sector (Reuver, Voorde, & Kilroy, 2019).

Absenteeism in public sector can be initial step of leaving the job and result in turn over.

Absenteeism is non-permanent and transient non presence from job due to causes like health issues, demise of close relatives or personal problems like maternal leaves etc. However absenteeism from job duties can also be deliberate and routine non presence from job (Čikeš,



Ribarić, & Črnjar, 2018). There are also other malpractices in the public sector that are less addressed in researches. For instance the association between equal job chances and encouraging motivating public sector employees (Kristanti & Yudiatmaja, 2022). Equal job chances impacts personal job contentment and work performance, absence of both can give rise to malpractice. Job satisfaction and employee work performance are impacted equivalently by job chances and public sector worker motivation.

Ghost workers

Ghost worker is a kind of offence practiced by bureaucrats to establish and maneuver compensation procedure in the public sector. Ghost workers are illegitimate and unlawful employees who exist in the payroll (Tefurukwa, 2021). The motive is to acquire illegitimate cash from ghost workers on payroll.

Theft of salaries

Salary theft has got very petty focus from regulators, policy makers to shed light upon salary inequality. Hence the reasons for salary theft issue in the public sector and the inability of political ruling elite to pay heed and consider the salary theft problem in the public sector needs to be identified (Hallett, 2018).

Training

Malpractices are also found in training of employees. Performance assessment is not connected and in line with training and development chances. Talent misuse and exploitation in Pakistan when it comes to Human resource activities like recruitment, appointment, retaining talent and training and growth of workers when gone through several issues (Zubair, 2020).

Meritocracy merit-based recruitment and promotion

Meritocracy is one of the basic and first steps to curb malpractice. It means that the recruitment process and appointment mechanism are credible, authentic, transparent and robust. Applicants with expertise, competency, education and professional proficiency to efficiently carry out high ranked public employees' duties. Embracing best and ethical practices and recognition of difficulties encountered meritocracy in public sector and its impact on curbing corruption, malpractice and nepotism (Haider, 2019).

Appraisal systems and performance management

Eradication of malpractice and corruption by encouraging a merit based performance appraisals and compensation is necessary for the sustenance of the public sector is important. For these reforms and regulation at governmental level to boost the performance of the sector and end the disparity between public and private sector (Ruffini, Modarelli, Sferrazzo, &



Turri, 2020). Appraisal is an outcome of important consideration majority of staff anticipate. Appraisals are the driving force and catalyst that motivates and makes workers to give their best daily in carrying out task.

Compensation management

Sound compensations management play a vital part in curbing malpractices as it motivates, encourages and appeal the workers. Compensation management in a larger picture includes both intrinsic and extrinsic remunerations (Mohammed, Mohammed, & Mohammad, 2022). Appropriate compensation is important for recognition and retention of skillful, moral and informative employees. Compensation is an important tool to curb malpractice in public sector as it drives performance, effort and a vital determinant of success or failure of an organization and sets the tone for ethical climate by eliminating motives for petty and big corruption (Aliku, Morka, & Igemohia, 2020).

Discipline and follow of Rules and Regulations

Low standard of work life and lack of discipline can give rise to malpractices in public sector organizations like employee dissatisfaction, enhanced worker absenteeism, low motivation towards tasks, low morale, decrease in productivity and bad performance of the sector and organization. Work conditions, overtime, work load, lengthy work, low salary and unfavorable climate of organization that gives rise to indiscipline. Issues also take place with respect to factors associated with staff integrity.

Codes of conduct

Code of ethics is useful and important mechanism to encourage integrity and curtail malpractices. The code of conduct must provide both written and verbal guidance by managers on ways to deal with moral paradoxes and predicaments and assist in how to react when encountered with ethical conundrum and quandary (Meyer-Sahling, 2020).

Training for Ethics

Ethical challenges that employees and human resource department deal with are immense in public sector. Ethical plight and perplexity as a model and foundation for enhancing executives' ethical training and awareness in giving importance to training requirements and planning appraisal parameters. Recognizing training requirements can be the first step and then assessment of efficiency of ethical training initiative can be followed for curbing malpractice in public sector (Winterberg, Brummel, Ayres, & Kerr, 2021).



Corruption

Corruption is frequently noticed in many small to big setups. Some common forms in the name of corruption are bribery, illicit enrichment, functional abuses including favoritism and nepotism, embezzlement, trading in influence etc. Common mindset behind these acts is the growth orientation, competition, lack of transparency, accountability, ethics problems, complicated leadership, political instability and so forth. According to study, corruption is usually done when some people want to have maximum personal gain. Internationally, corruption has different terms like money laundering, abuse of power, extortion, fraud, cartels etc. Furthermore, one of the major reasons behind corruption in private organizations are low wages, low job opportunities, absences of strictness or fast punishment, no fear to bad reputation, less to no public unity, transparency lacking in dealing and other affairs and etc. (Ahmad et al., 2020).

Role of HR in combating corruption in the private organization

HR of the good organizations usually work on the zero tolerance approach to corruption and bribery. However, in every organization, HR must have to work at the zero tolerance to maintain the company eruption in the public and among their competitors in the market. There are some supporting roles of human resource in terms of corporate commitment to ethics, integrity and values that helps in sustaining the anti-bribery strategy in the functions of the organizations. In human resource practice, the processes or procedures ranging from reporting procedures to particular training initiatives must be put into action (Khan and Andreoni, 2019).

Absenteeism

Absenteeism is the general phenomena all over the globe and in another term absenteeism is called as “Bottom Line Killer” that has a significant influence on the productivity and economy. Excessive absence has also been included as corruption because sometime employees blackmail the company by doing so. The common reasons behind the shortage of staff are the dissatisfaction from job, chronic medical issues, living far from office or workplace, rotating shift leading stress and ongoing personal or family issues. In maximum cases, absenteeism costs higher to employees along dropping of morale and other factors (Mastekaasa, 2020).

Human resource management role in controlling Absenteeism

Human resource can improve software that highlight the absenteeism data clearly. Furthermore, it can develop policy for interview on return to work in which the reason of the



absence should be discussed with developing a fit note. Moreover, human resource must deal the situation carefully so that the person do not feel uncomfortable or feel pressured. Even the tone of conversation should be professional. Like a chronic absentee, human resource must encourage the person on returning to work. Such interviews should not by over 5 minutes asking all the major questions and make the employee understand what the organization demands from the employee. With a critical situation, company may provide flexible working hours or make the schedule comfortable for the employee.

Nepotism

Worldwide nepotism is common and has big impact on organizational functions. All over the world, this act of nepotism can not be termed illegal but might have the chance to conduct illegal actions or unexpected consequences. Nepotism in family owned business due to having sufficient education or in the family, a nepotist is entitled for that position by CEO of the company. In such cases, the organizational culture also get disturbed by hiring family person at senior level with lots of dissimilarities, social status, thoughts, background, beliefs and so forth. This phenomenon is many times hard to manage by the HR despite obeying of the nepotee instruction (Ayoub, et al., 2019).

Role of HR in combating nepotism in private organizations

Employee conflicts: Employee conflicts are one of common elements that affect the working environment of any organization. Human resource department has to play the role to respond conflicts to manage the relationship among employees or manager. Nearly 80% of the conflicts in private organizations are among managers and employees. Common conflicts at the workplace are the difference in styles, interdependence conflicts; difference in leadership styles, background difference around or gender difference, personality clashes, difference in approach to work or conflict in contrasting outlook towards life etc.

Gender inequality: Gender inequality or gender gap is one of major reason for conflicts which may lead to malpractice. Studies described that women and men perceive information differently that effects on the feeling and emotions of exclusion. In few cases, such things lead to allegation to harassment. Moreover, in terms of gender inequality, racism, unequal pay, promotion disparity, giving priority to male over female or vice versa in hiring and placement. Interdependence is yet another factor of conflicts that may lead to malpractice affecting credibility of the individual(s) (Vuong & Sid., 2020).

Favoritism: It is yet another common malpractice in private organization in which an employee is treated with more favor especially by the managers or by the top positioned



employees. Mostly, favors are given in terms of perks or privileges which one does not deserve. This discrimination or mistreatment is considered as illegal but is common practice in the private organizations. Even, the boss favoritism is also common which eventually makes the environment unhealthy and uncomfortable to the rest of the employees (Akca, 2020).

Research Questions

- What are the common malpractices impacting the performance of private and public organizations?
- What are the common factors of responsible for malpractices in the private and public organizations?
- What are the common HRM activities that can help in reducing common malpractices in private and public organizations?

Research Methodology

Research Design

The study design was combination of qualitative, quantitative and observational study. The study was conducted in Karachi consisting of executives of private and public organizations. Duration of the study was six months from February 2022 to July 2022. All executives of private and public organizations of Karachi. Convenient purposive sampling was used for the study. Selected executives of private and public organizations were interviewed at a place other than their organizations. A total of 106 executives were contacted out of which 67 consented to participate in the study. The data was collected through a predesigned close ended questionnaire. conducted on mobile phone.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria: Inclusion Criteria

Executives of private and public organizations having more than five year experience.

Exclusion Criteria: Those who did not fulfill the inclusion criteria. Before the actual interview the participants were briefed about the content of the questionnaire. Those who gave their consent and time were later contacted for the interviews. They were informed about the confidentiality about the interview. They were also informed that their participation and input would not be shared with one other than the researcher and her supervisor. This followed the survey. The data was analyzed using SPSS and Excel software applications.



Data Analysis

Table 1
Demographics

DEMOGRAPHICS					
TYPE OF THE ORGANIZATION			GENDER		
	Frequency	Percent		Frequency	Percent
Public	43	64.2	Male	38	56.7
Private	24	35.8	Female	29	43.3
Total	67	100.0	Total	67	100.0
AGE			HOUSE HOLD INCOME		
30-39 years	24	35.8	Less than Rs. 50 thousand	9	13.43
40 -49 years	27	40.3	Rs. 50-99 thousand	23	34.33
50-59 years	16	23.9	Rs. 100 - 149 thousand	18	26.87
Total	67	100.0	Rs. 150-199 thousand	17	25.37
			Total	67	100.0

Interpretation:

Out of the total 67 participants 43 (64.2%) were from the public sector while 24 (35.8%) were from the private sector. There were 38(56.7%) males while 29 (43.3%) female. Age wise 24 (35.8% were of 24 years, 27 (40.3%) were of 40-49 years and 16 (23.9%) were of 50-59 years. Household income wise 23 (34.33%) had 50-99 thousand, 18 (26.87%) had Rs 100 – 149 thousand, 17 (25.37%) has Rs. 150-199 thousand. Only 9 (13.43%) had income less than 50 thousand.

Table 2
Regression Analysis 1

Model Summary ^b											
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics					Durbin - Watson	P/Sig value
					R Square Change	F Change	df 1	df 2	Sig. F Change		
1	.882 ^a	0.777	0.718	0.28662	0.777	12.974	14	52	0.000	0.740	0

a. Predictors: (Constant), b. Dependent

Interpretation

Predictors: (constant), malpractices severity: political intervention, malpractices severity: buying, malpractices severity: allowances, malpractices severity: absenteeism, malpractices severity: selling, malpractices severity: salary theft, malpractices severity: nepotism , malpractices severity: gender inequality, malpractices severity: reward /incentive, malpractices severity: promotion, malpractices severity: ghost workers, malpractices severity:



hiring , malpractices severity: salary, malpractices severity: transfer have a strong positive relationship with the dependent variable Dependent Variable: HR department is enabled to curb malpractices in Pakistani business culture (Durbin Watson value 0.740). The values of R, R2 and adjusted R2 0.882, 0.777 and 0.718 supports the above findings. It further elaborates that the independent variables support the dependent variable up to the extent of 88.2%, 77.7% and 71.8% respectively.

Table 3
Regression Analysis 2

Model Summary ^b											
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics					Durbin-Watson	P/Sig value
					R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change		
2	.946 ^a	0.894	0.852	0.20764	0.894	20.957	19	47	0.000	1.562	0
a. Predictors: (Constant),											
b. Dependent Variable:											

Interpretation

Predictors: (Constant), role of HR in improving negligence offences, role of HR in improving lack of fairness, role of HR in improving lack of good citizenship, role of HR in improving lack of experience, role of HR in improving lack of caring, role of HR in improving inadequate work evaluation , role of HR in improving lack of responsibility, role of HR in improving lack of strategy, role of HR in improving breach of contract, role of HR in improving lack of respect, role of HR in improving intellectual property infringement, role of HR in improving bad planning, role of HR in improving poor leadership, role of HR in improving poor cash flow management, role of HR in improving lack of trustworthiness, role of HR in improving overdependence on few big customers , role of HR in improving overwork, role of HR in improving lack of fund, role of HR in improving employment discrimination has a weak relationship with the dependent variable HR department is enabled to curb malpractices in Pakistani business culture (Durbin Watson value 1.562). This is also evident from the values of R, R2 and adjusted R2 0.946, 0.894 and 0.852 respectively.



Table 4
Regression Analysis 3

Model Summary ^b											
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics					Durbin-Watson	P/Sig value
					R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change		
3	.919 ^a	0.845	0.827	0.22428	0.845	46.085	7	59	0.000	0.690	0
a. Predictors: (Constant),											
b. Dependent Variable:											

Interpretation

Predictors: (Constant), deceit, duplicity and deception common in your organization, work ethics in your organization are based on moral and ethical considerations, employees of your organization work ethically and religiously to accomplish the given task, rivalry among peers and colleagues common and disturb the smooth functioning or the work flow, the conduct of supervisors and other management personnel fair and based on ethical and moral values and norms of the society, promotions in your organization is fairly done, rules and regulations of your organization followed in letter and spirit, have a very strong relationship with the dependent variable HR department is enabled to curb malpractices in Pakistani business culture (Durbin Watson value 0.690). This is also evident from the values of R, R² and adjusted R² 0.919, 0.845 and 0.827 respectively.

Table 5
Regression Analysis 4

Model Summary ^b											
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics					Durbin - Watson	P/Sig value
					R Square Change	F Change	df 1	df 2	Sig. F Change		
4	.975 ^a	0.950	0.917	0.15508	0.950	29.159	26	40	0.000	2.272	0
a. Predictors: (Constant),											
b. Dependent Variable:											



Interpretation

Predictors: (Constant), deceit, duplicity and deception common in your organization, role of HR in improving negligence offences, role of HR in improving lack of fairness, role of HR in improving lack of good citizenship, role of HR in improving lack of experience, role of HR in improving inadequate work evaluation , role of HR in improving lack of responsibility, rivalry among peers and colleagues common and disturb the smooth functioning or the work flow, role of HR in improving lack of strategy, role of HR in improving breach of contract, role of HR in improving intellectual property infringement, employees of your organization work ethically and religiously to accomplish the given task, role of HR in improving bad planning, role of HR in improving lack of respect, role of HR in improving lack of caring, role of HR in improving poor leadership, promotions in your organization is fairly done, role of HR in improving poor cash flow management, role of HR in improving overdependence on few big customers , role of HR in improving overwork, role of HR in improving lack of trustworthiness, role of HR in improving employment discrimination, role of HR in improving lack of fund , rules and regulations of your organization followed in letter and spirit, work ethics in your organization are based on moral and ethical considerations, the conduct of supervisors and other management personnel fair and based on ethical and moral values and norms of the society and dependent Variable: HR department is enabled to curb malpractices in Pakistani business culture have almost no relationship (Durbin Watson value 2.272).). This is also evident from the values of R, R2 and adjusted R2 0.975, 0.950 and 0.917 respectively.

Table 6
 Pearson Correlation: Malpractices Severity

Posterior Distribution Characterization for Pairwise Correlations ^a																
			AB SE NTI SM	NE PO TIS M	GE ND ER INE QU ALI TY	HI RI N G	PRO MO TIO N	TR AN SF ER	S A L A R Y	RE WA RD /IN CE NTI VE	ALL OW ANC ES	BUYI NG	SEL LIN G	SA LA RY TH EFT	GH OST WO RKE RS	POLI TICA L INTE RVE NTIO N
ABS ENTI SM	Pos teri or	Mo de		0.87	0.80	0.9	0.946	0.95	0.9	0.85	0.923	0.792	0.85	0.82	0.804	0.940
		Me an		0.87 0	0.79 6	0.9 32	0.942	0.94 9	0.9 02	0.84 9	0.917	0.778	0.84 4	0.81 2	0.791	0.935
		Var ian ce		0.00 1	0.00 2	0.0 00	0.000	0.00 0	0.0 01	0.00 1	0.000	0.002	0.00 1	0.00 2	0.002	0.000



	95 % Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.809	0.706	0.899	0.914	0.924	0.855	0.780	0.877	0.681	0.772	0.728	0.698	0.904
		Upper Bound	0.924	0.878	0.961	0.967	0.971	0.944	0.912	0.953	0.867	0.909	0.888	0.875	0.963
	N	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
NEP OTIS M	Poserior	Mode	0.879	0.926	0.860	0.916	0.904	0.979	0.945	0.842	0.902	0.950	0.942	0.915	0.959
		Mean	0.870	0.920	0.849	0.909	0.896	0.977	0.940	0.830	0.894	0.946	0.937	0.908	0.956
		Variance	0.001	0.000	0.001	0.000	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
	95 % Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.809	0.881	0.781	0.867	0.847	0.966	0.911	0.754	0.845	0.919	0.907	0.864	0.934
		Upper Bound	0.924	0.954	0.912	0.948	0.940	0.987	0.966	0.901	0.939	0.969	0.965	0.947	0.975
	N	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
GEN DER INEQUALITY	Poserior	Mode	0.809	0.926	0.799	0.839	0.832	0.919	0.948	0.788	0.971	0.936	0.964	0.982	0.895
		Mean	0.796	0.920	0.786	0.827	0.820	0.913	0.944	0.775	0.969	0.931	0.961	0.980	0.887
		Variance	0.002	0.000	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.001
	95 % Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.706	0.881	0.692	0.750	0.739	0.871	0.917	0.677	0.953	0.898	0.942	0.970	0.834
		Upper Bound	0.878	0.954	0.872	0.898	0.893	0.950	0.968	0.865	0.982	0.961	0.978	0.989	0.935
	N	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
HIRI NG	Poserior	Mode	0.937	0.860	0.799	0.969	0.970	0.877	0.833	0.986	0.785	0.824	0.805	0.800	0.894
		Mean	0.932	0.849	0.786	0.966	0.967	0.867	0.821	0.984	0.771	0.812	0.792	0.787	0.886
		Variance	0.000	0.001	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.002	0.000	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.001
	95 % Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.899	0.781	0.692	0.950	0.951	0.806	0.741	0.977	0.672	0.729	0.699	0.694	0.833
		Upper Bound	0.961	0.912	0.872	0.981	0.982	0.922	0.895	0.991	0.862	0.889	0.875	0.873	0.934
	N	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
	Mode	0.946	0.916	0.839	0.969	0.991	0.926	0.881	0.955	0.826	0.875	0.849	0.837	0.937	



PROMOTION	Pos teri or	Me an	0.9 42	0.90 9	0.82 7	0.9 66		0.99 0	0.9 20	0.87 2	0.952	0.814	0.86 5	0.83 8	0.826	0.932
		Var ian ce	0.0 00	0.00 0	0.00 2	0.0 00		0.00 0	0.0 00	0.00 1	0.000	0.002	0.00 1	0.00 1	0.002	0.000
	95 % Cre dib le Int erv al	Lo wer Bo und	0.9 14	0.86 7	0.75 0	0.9 50		0.98 5	0.8 81	0.81 3	0.928	0.731	0.80 3	0.76 4	0.747	0.899
		Up per Bo und	0.9 67	0.94 8	0.89 8	0.9 81		0.99 5	0.9 54	0.92 6	0.973	0.890	0.92 1	0.90 5	0.897	0.961
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
TRANSFER	Pos teri or	Mo de	0.9 53	0.90 4	0.83 2	0.9 70	0.991		0.9 28	0.87 8	0.966	0.817	0.87 5	0.84 4	0.829	0.940
		Me an	0.9 49	0.89 6	0.82 0	0.9 67	0.990		0.9 22	0.86 8	0.963	0.805	0.86 6	0.83 3	0.817	0.935
		Var ian ce	0.0 00	0.00 1	0.00 2	0.0 00	0.000		0.0 00	0.00 1	0.000	0.002	0.00 1	0.00 1	0.002	0.000
	95 % Cre dib le Int erv al	Lo wer Bo und	0.9 24	0.84 7	0.73 9	0.9 51	0.985		0.8 85	0.80 7	0.944	0.718	0.80 3	0.75 7	0.735	0.904
		Up per Bo und	0.9 71	0.94 0	0.89 3	0.9 82	0.995		0.9 56	0.92 3	0.979	0.884	0.92 2	0.90 1	0.892	0.963
N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	
SALARY	Pos teri or	Mo de	0.9 09	0.97 9	0.91 9	0.8 77	0.926	0.92 8		0.94 3	0.866	0.889	0.95 0	0.94 0	0.905	0.980
		Me an	0.9 02	0.97 7	0.91 3	0.8 67	0.920	0.92 2		0.93 8	0.856	0.881	0.94 5	0.93 5	0.898	0.978
		Var ian ce	0.0 01	0.00 0	0.00 0	0.0 01	0.000	0.00 0		0.00 0	0.001	0.001	0.00 0	0.00 0	0.001	0.000
	95 % Cre dib le Int erv al	Lo wer Bo und	0.8 55	0.96 6	0.87 1	0.8 06	0.881	0.88 5		0.90 7	0.790	0.825	0.91 9	0.90 4	0.850	0.967
		Up per Bo und	0.9 44	0.98 7	0.95 0	0.9 22	0.954	0.95 6		0.96 4	0.916	0.931	0.96 9	0.96 3	0.941	0.988
N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	
REWARD/INCENTIVE	Pos teri or	Mo de	0.8 59	0.94 5	0.94 8	0.8 33	0.881	0.87 8	0.9 43		0.820	0.948	0.95 3	0.97 2	0.935	0.932
		Me an	0.8 49	0.94 0	0.94 4	0.8 21	0.872	0.86 8	0.9 38		0.808	0.944	0.94 9	0.96 9	0.930	0.926
		Var ian ce	0.0 01	0.00 0	0.00 0	0.0 02	0.001	0.00 1	0.0 00		0.002	0.000	0.00 0	0.00 0	0.000	0.000
	95 % Cre dib le Int erv al	Lo wer Bo und	0.7 80	0.91 1	0.91 7	0.7 41	0.813	0.80 7	0.9 07		0.723	0.916	0.92 4	0.95 4	0.896	0.891
		Up per Bo und	0.9 12	0.96 6	0.96 8	0.8 95	0.926	0.92 3	0.9 64		0.886	0.968	0.97 1	0.98 3	0.960	0.958
N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	



	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
ALLOWANCES	Poserior	Mode	0.923	0.842	0.788	0.986	0.955	0.966	0.866	0.820		0.773	0.812	0.793	0.790	0.883
		Mean	0.917	0.830	0.775	0.984	0.952	0.963	0.856	0.808		0.759	0.799	0.780	0.776	0.875
		Variance	0.000	0.001	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.002		0.003	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.001
	95% Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.877	0.754	0.677	0.977	0.928	0.944	0.790	0.723		0.654	0.710	0.684	0.679	0.816
		Upper Bound	0.953	0.901	0.865	0.991	0.973	0.979	0.916	0.886		0.854	0.880	0.868	0.866	0.927
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
BUYING	Poserior	Mode	0.792	0.902	0.971	0.785	0.826	0.817	0.889	0.948	0.773		0.933	0.955	0.981	0.863
		Mean	0.778	0.894	0.969	0.771	0.814	0.805	0.881	0.944	0.759		0.927	0.951	0.980	0.853
		Variance	0.002	0.001	0.000	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.001	0.000	0.003		0.000	0.000	0.000	0.001
	95% Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.681	0.845	0.953	0.672	0.731	0.718	0.825	0.916	0.654		0.892	0.927	0.970	0.787
		Upper Bound	0.867	0.939	0.982	0.862	0.890	0.884	0.931	0.968	0.854		0.959	0.973	0.989	0.915
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
SELLING	Poserior	Mode	0.854	0.950	0.936	0.824	0.875	0.875	0.950	0.953	0.812	0.933		0.950	0.930	0.928
		Mean	0.844	0.946	0.931	0.812	0.865	0.866	0.945	0.949	0.799	0.927		0.946	0.924	0.922
		Variance	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.001	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.000		0.000	0.000	0.000
	95% Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.772	0.919	0.898	0.729	0.803	0.803	0.919	0.924	0.710	0.892		0.919	0.888	0.885
		Upper Bound	0.909	0.969	0.961	0.889	0.921	0.922	0.969	0.971	0.880	0.959		0.969	0.957	0.956
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
SALARY THEFT	Poserior	Mode	0.824	0.942	0.964	0.805	0.849	0.844	0.940	0.972	0.793	0.955	0.950		0.949	0.913
		Mean	0.812	0.937	0.961	0.792	0.838	0.833	0.935	0.969	0.780	0.951	0.946		0.945	0.906
		Variance	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.001	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.000	0.000		0.000	0.000
	95% Credible	Lower Bound	0.728	0.907	0.942	0.699	0.764	0.757	0.904	0.954	0.684	0.927	0.919		0.918	0.862



	le Interval	Upper Bound	0.888	0.965	0.978	0.875	0.905	0.901	0.963	0.983	0.868	0.973	0.969		0.969	0.946
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
GHOST WORKERS	Poserior	Mode	0.804	0.915	0.982	0.800	0.837	0.829	0.905	0.935	0.790	0.981	0.930	0.949		0.883
		Mean	0.791	0.908	0.980	0.787	0.826	0.817	0.898	0.930	0.776	0.980	0.924	0.945		0.873
		Variance	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.001	0.000	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.000		0.001
	95% Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.698	0.864	0.970	0.694	0.747	0.735	0.850	0.896	0.679	0.970	0.888	0.918		0.815
		Upper Bound	0.875	0.947	0.989	0.873	0.897	0.892	0.941	0.960	0.866	0.989	0.957	0.969		0.927
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
POLITICAL INTERVENTION	Poserior	Mode	0.940	0.959	0.895	0.894	0.937	0.940	0.980	0.932	0.883	0.863	0.928	0.913		0.883
		Mean	0.935	0.956	0.887	0.886	0.932	0.935	0.978	0.926	0.875	0.853	0.922	0.906		0.873
		Variance	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.001	0.000	0.000		0.001
	95% Credible Interval	Lower Bound	0.904	0.934	0.834	0.833	0.899	0.904	0.967	0.891	0.816	0.787	0.885	0.862		0.815
		Upper Bound	0.963	0.975	0.935	0.934	0.961	0.963	0.988	0.958	0.927	0.915	0.956	0.946		0.927
	N		67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67	67
a. The analyses assume reference priors (c = 0).																

Interpretation

Pearson correlation denotes the relationship between two values. It has a value of -1 to +1. A – value means there is no correlation between the two values while a + value indicates that there is a positive correlation between the two values.

Based on the values mentioned in the Table 6 we may say that there is a positive correlation between absenteeism and nepotism, gender inequality, hiring, promotion, transfer, salary, reward / incentive, allowances, buying, selling, salary theft, ghost workers and political intervention.



Table 8
Hypothesis Summary

		Finding
H1	Common malpractices impact the performance of private organizations	Accepted
H2	Common malpractices impact the performance of public organizations	Accepted
H3	There are some common factors of responsible for malpractices in the private organizations	Accepted
H4	There are some common factors of responsible for malpractices in the public organizations	Accepted
H5	HRM activities can help in reducing common malpractices in private organizations	Neither accepted nor rejected
H6	HRM activities can help in reducing common malpractices in public organizations	Neither accepted nor rejected
H7	HR department is enabled to curb malpractices in Pakistani business culture	Neither accepted nor rejected

Conclusion and Discussion

Discussion

HR management is mainly based on three key factors: merit based recruitment and promotion, tenure of employment without getting influenced of political pressure and standardized compensation packages (Transparency International, 2023). This research finds that such practices are not religiously followed in Pakistan. In recent years countries have started downsizing balancing the need and productivity of the workforce (World Bank 2013). This study finds that no such practices are done in Pakistan. Officials use their discretionary powers to employ and promote friends and relatives or even political supporters. Political influence in appointments is also in practice in Pakistan as it is in some other countries as well. (Poocharoen and Brillantes 2013). Such practices of nepotism and favoritism also prevails in Pakistan.

In terms of political influence or interference it was found that in US during 1970s less than 10 percent Congress members were lobbyists, while in 2012 more than half of the Congress members were found to be lobbyists (Brezis and Cariolle 2014). Lobbying leads to conflicts and corruption and should be discouraged. But in Pakistan such practices prevail according to this research study.

According to our research salary scam is prevalent in Pakistan as well. In 2014 Zimbabwe was hit by salary scam involving senior executives of public enterprises getting hefty amount under salary and expenses. Also enjoying other benefits like fuel and air travel (Ncube 2014).



In Tanzania the amount allocated for allowances was 59% of the total wage bill during 2009/2010 (Policy Forum 2009).

Conclusions

The following factors were considered more important regarding the HR role for improvement: lack of trustworthiness, lack of responsibility; lack of fairness, lack of caring; lack of good citizenship, poor leadership, improving overwork, lack of experience, inadequate work evaluation, breach of contract, employment discrimination, intellectual property infringement. Majority of the respondents mentioned that HR department is working effectively and efficiently in their organization and is enabled to curb malpractices in Pakistani business culture.

The findings also shows the conflict of social norms in moral and ethical value system. A robust political dedication if absent that there exist a void and disparity in regulations stated in books and their actual execution to counter corruption in the public sector. Lack of resources of judicial mechanism and machinery that includes human resource is a persistent, long lived and deep rooted issue and it also creates hindrance in the way of performance of the sector and lawful actions and proceeding to address corrupt practices related to HR in the public sector. When hiring, promotions, pay raises are impacted and determined by corruption, this leads in creation of web and nexus of abettors. In wider borderline terminals and depot dockyards, waterfronts, wharfs, airfields and air stations, corruption is carried out by suitably well planned networks, where belief and correlated and mutual dependence and benefit exist.

To curb the malpractices an anticorruption framework needs to be established to avert the influence and power of such strong networks to minimize the ethical price and financial cost associated with malpractice and corruption in HRM practices in the public sector. The behavior of top leadership and senior HRM personnel is vital in eliminating malpractice in the public sector. The way inside monitoring units function and prospective corrupt individual who can easily be bribed in the workforce and management needs to be identified and penalized. Ethics, professionalism and moral standards need to govern HRM practices in the public sector.

Talent management, giving appealing and progressive career plans, making appointments based on merit and transparency for prominent administrative posts and strong human resource development policy that takes care of compliance to required norms, actions and behavior. Dedication to ensure integrity in HRM activities whistle blowing and reporting of



corrupt practices. Role model and mentor the staff by practicing transparency, ethics and integrity for rest of the public sector organization employees to follow. Appropriate orientation of fresh workers, a robust human resource management system, job security and better job arrangements. Prudent benefits for workers and appropriate compensation based on performance minimize motives and pressure to indulge in corruption and malpractices. Furthermore fostering, inculcating, institutionalizing, cultivating a culture of integrity and high moral standards that govern HRM practices are helpful to curb corruption in the public sector.

Hence good administration and appropriate governance boost the morale of workers in the public sector and substantially discourage mal practice. Effective management that governs on the principles of fairness, justness, transparency, equality, answerability, righteousness, integrity and engagement and involvement of staff enhances job satisfaction and curbs the motives for corrupt behavior. Good salary, compensations, close monitoring, training initiatives, measures to create ethical awareness, and promotions based on performance appraisal can curb corruption significantly in HRM department in public sector. Boosting the part played by public agencies in encouraging values of good governance in the public sector via anti-corruption initiatives to boost performance and productivity of the sector and preservation of public funds, audit to ensure best practices in human resource administration in the public sector.

References

- Ahammad, M. F., Glaister, K. W., & Gomes, E. (2020). Strategic agility and human resource management. *Human Resource Management Review*, 30(1), 100700.
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1053482218307435>
- Ahmad, J., Ahmad, A., & Salahuddin, T. (2020). Tolerance to Petty Corruption in Public Sector: A Review. *Pakistan Vision*, 21(1), 168.
http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/studies/PDF-FILES/13_v21_1_20.pdf
- Akca, M. (2020). An investigation of the relationship between favoritism and workplace deviance: meditation role of negative emotions. In *Analyzing Workplace Deviance in Modern Organizations* (pp. 114-138). IGI Global. <https://www.igi-global.com/chapter/an-investigation-of-the-relationship-between-favoritism-and-workplace-deviance/236386>
- Aliku, I. H., Morka, T. O., & Igemohia, F. (2020). Compensation Management and Employee Performance: Manufacturing Industry in Focus. *Palarch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology* 17(7), 8792-8810. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <file:///C:/Users/DELL1/Downloads/3697-Article%20Text-7107-1-10-20201224.pdf>
- Aparicio, A. (2021, August 12). Compensation Management: Theories & Challenges. *Study*. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://study.com/academy/lesson/compensation-management-theories-challenges.html>



- Arici, H. E., Arasli, H., Çobanoğlu, C., & Hejraty Namin, B. (2021). The effect of favoritism on job embeddedness in the hospitality industry: A mediation study of organizational justice. *International Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Administration*, 22(4), 383-411. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/15256480.2019.1650685>
- Armstrong, M. (2020). *Human resource management practice*. Kogan page limited. <http://103.38.12.142:8081/jspui/bitstream/123456789/71/1/A%20Handbook%20of%20Human%20Resource%20Management%20Practice.pdf>
- Ayoub, A., Potdar, V., Rudra, A., & Luong, H. (2019, December). Impact of Nepotism on the Human Resources Component of ERP Systems Implementation in Lebanon. In *International Conference on Big Data and Security* (pp. 116-134). Springer, Singapore. https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-981-15-7530-3_9
- Baporikar, N. (2020). Human Resource Management for Managing Cultural Diversity. *International Journal of Applied Management Sciences and Engineering (IJAMSE)*, 7(1), 74-99. <https://www.igi-global.com/article/human-resource-management-for-managing-cultural-diversity/246857>
- Bertay, A. C., Dordevic, L., & Sever, C. (2020). *Gender inequality and economic growth: Evidence from industry-level data*. International Monetary Fund. <https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=D7EaEAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA3&dq=Human+resource+and+gender+inequality&ots=HoapSU9iXi&sig=HM1IRh7ou6b46wyfX5c-4GMzqqg>
- Brezis E. S. and Cariolle J. 2014. The Revolving Door Indicator: Estimating the Distortionary Power of the Revolving Door, U4 Brief, <http://www.u4.no/publications/the-revolving-door-indicator-estimating-the-distortionary-power-of-the-revolving-door/>
- Brookins, M. (2019, February 1). Ways to Prevent Unethical Behavior in the Workplace. *Chron*. Retrieved November 25, 2021 from <https://smallbusiness.chron.com/ways-prevent-unethical-behavior-workplace-21344.html>
- Čikeš, V., Ribarić, H.M., & Črnjar, K. (2018). The Determinants and Outcomes of Absence Behavior: A Systematic Literature Review. *Social Sciences*, 7(8), 1-26. <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci7080120>. Retrieved October 6, 2022 from <https://www.mdpi.com/2076-0760/7/8/120/htm>
- De Mello e Souza, C. A. (2019). Up Close and Friendly: A Study of Compassion and Favoritism by Human Resource Professionals. <https://escholarshare.drake.edu/bitstream/handle/2092/2195/DMR081202R.pdf?sequence=1>
- Erasmus, B. J. (2018). Unethical behaviour in Human Resource Management practices in South Africa: Views of Human Resource practitioners. *Journal of Contemporary Management Issues*, 23(2), 65-86. Retrieved November 25, 2021 from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329716100_Unethical_behaviour_in_Human_Resource_Management_practices_in_South_Africa_Views_of_Human_Resource_practitioners or <https://doi.org/10.30924/mjcmi/2018.23.1.65>
- Gatchalian, J. (2021, March 17). 5 Ways Unethical Behaviour Can Damage HR Functions. *HR Zone*. Retrieved November 26, 2021 from



<https://www.hrzone.com/community/blogs/jason-gatchalian/5-ways-unethical-behaviour-can-damage-hr-functions>

Haider, H. (2019). *Merit-based recruitment in the public sector: effectiveness and challenges* (K4D Helpdesk Report). Brighton, UK: Institute of Development Studies. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from

https://opendocs.ids.ac.uk/opendocs/bitstream/handle/20.500.12413/14819/695_Merit_based_recruitment_in_the_public_sector_effectiveness_and_challenges.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Hallett, N. (2018). The Problem of Wage Theft. *Yale Law & Policy Review*, 37(1), 93-152. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26602004>

Hauser, C. (2019). Fighting against corruption: does anti-corruption training make any difference?. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 159(1), 281-299.

<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10551-018-3808-3>

Itoo, B. (2019, February 19). Numerous Ethical and Unethical Practices done by HR in an organization. *Bushra's Blog*. Retrieved November 26, 2021 from

<https://legitgrotesque.wordpress.com/2019/02/19/numerous-ethical-and-unethical-practices-done-by-hr-in-an-organization/>

Khan, M., Andreoni, A., & Roy, P. (2019). Anti-corruption in adverse contexts: strategies for improving implementation. <https://eprints.soas.ac.uk/32530/1/ACE-WorkingPaper013-AntiCorruptionAdverseContexts-Text-190909.pdf>

Kreismann, D. & Talaulicar, T. (2020). Business Ethics Training in Human Resource Development: A Literature Review. *Human Resource Development Review*, 20(1), 68-105. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1534484320983533>. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1534484320983533>

Kristanti, D., & Yudiatmaja, W. E. (2022). Antecedents of Work Outcomes of Local Government Employees: The Mediating Role of Public Service Motivation. *Policy & Governance Review*, 6(3), 247-263. <https://doi.org/10.30589/pgr.v6i3.491>. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://journal.iapa.or.id/pgr/article/view/491>

Martanto, J., Tippe, S., & Santoso, B. (2020). The Effect of Integrity, And Discipline on Quality of Work Life (QwI) Government Internal Supervision Officers Republic of Indonesia Ministry of Law and Human Rights. *International Journal of Scientific Research and Management*, 8(3), -645-650. DOI: 10.18535/ijstrm/v8i03.sh02. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://www.ijstrm.in/index.php/ijstrm/article/view/2621>

Mastekaasa, A. (2020). Absenteeism in the Public and the Private Sector: Does the Public Sector Attract High Absence Employees?. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 30(1), 60-76. <https://academic.oup.com/jpart/article-abstract/30/1/60/5423995>

Meyer-Sahling, J., Mikkelsen, K.S., & Schuster, C. (2018). Civil service management and corruption: What we know and what we don't. *Public Administration*, 1-10.

<https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12404>. Retrieved September 13, 2022 from

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/padm.12404>



- Michael, A. (2019). A handbook of human resource management practice.
<http://103.5.132.213:8080/jspui/bitstream/123456789/794/1/Handbook%20of%20Human%20Resource.Management.Practice.pdf>
- Mohammed, A. I., Mohammed, Z. F., & Mohammad, H. A. (2022). The Effect of Compensation Management on Employee Performance: An Empirical Study in North Gas Company. *World Bulletin of Management and Law*, 7, 59-70. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://scholarexpress.net/index.php/wbml/article/view/555>
- Mohapatra, S. K., & Sandhyavani, K. V. (2020). Factors Influencing the Effectiveness of the Performance Appraisal System in Public Sector Undertaking. *Palarch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology* 17(7), 10354-10368. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://www.archives.palarch.nl/index.php/jae/article/view/4075>
- Mousa, M., Massoud, H. K., & Ayoubi, R. M. (2020). Gender, diversity management perceptions, workplace happiness and organisational citizenship behaviour. *Employee Relations: The International Journal*.
<https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/ER-10-2019-0385/full/html>
- Ncube, F. 2014. Corporate Governance and Executive Compensation in Zimbabwean State-Owned Enterprises: a Case of Institutionalised Predation.
<http://article.sapub.org/10.5923.j.mm.20140406.01.htm>
- Nieto-Morales, F., & Ríos, V. (2021). Human resource management as a tool to control corruption: Evidence from Mexican municipal governments. *Public Administration*.
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/padm.12782>
- Policy Forum. 2009. Reforming Allowances: a Win-win Approach to Improved Service Delivery, Higher Salaries for Civil Servants and Saving Money.
[http://www.twaweza.org/uploads/files/Reforming%20Allowances_PF\(2\).pdf](http://www.twaweza.org/uploads/files/Reforming%20Allowances_PF(2).pdf)
- Preventing public sector corruption. (2019). *UNODC*. Retrieved September 13, 2022 from <https://www.unodc.org/e4j/en/anti-corruption/module-4/key-issues/preventing-public-sector-corruption.html>
- Poocharoen, O. and Brillantes, A. (2013). Meritocracy in Asia Pacific: Status Issues and Challenges. <http://rop.sagepub.com/content/33/2/140.abstract>
- Reuver, R. D., Voorde, K. V. D., & Kilroy, S. (2019). When do bundles of high performance work systems reduce employee absenteeism? The moderating role of workload. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 32(13), 2889-2909.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2019.1616594>. Retrieved October 6, 2022 from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09585192.2019.1616594>
- Rubel, M. R. B., Rimi, N. N., Yusliza, M., & Kee, D. M. H. (2018). High commitment human resource management practices and employee service behaviour: Trust in management as mediator. *IIMB Management Review*, 30(4), 316-329.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iimb.2018.05.006>. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0970389618302453>
- Ruffini, R. Modarelli, G. Sferrazzo, R., & Turri, M. (2020). Is merit pay changing ethos in public administration? *Cogent Business & Management*, 7(1), 1-15.



- <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2020.1724703>. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/23311975.2020.1724703?needAccess=true>
- Sahoo, R., & Sahoo, C. K. (2019). Organizational justice, conflict management and employee relations: The mediating role of climate of trust. *International Journal of Manpower*. <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/IJM-12-2017-0342/full/html>
- Shaan. (2019, February 24). Current Ethical and Unethical issues in discipline of Human Resource Management (HRM), Finance. *Shaan Blog Spot*. Retrieved November 26, 2021 from <https://shaanethicalandunethicalissuesinhrm.blogspot.com/2019/02/current-ethical-and-unethical-issues-in.html>
- Sroka, W., & Vveinhardt, J. (2020, June). Nepotism and favouritism: how harmful are these phenomena?. In *Forum Scientiae Oeconomia* (Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 79-91). <https://www.cceol.com/search/article-detail?id=877803>
- Tefurukwa, O. W. (2021). Managing Ghost Workers Fraud on Payroll in Tanzania: A Conceptual Framework. *International Journal of Governance and Public Policy Analysis*, 3(1), 75-103. DOI:10.31357/ijgppa.v3i01.5571. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/359667802_Managing_Ghost_Workers_Fraud_on_Payroll_in_Tanzania_A_Conceptual_Framework
- Transparency International (2023), Corruption and anti-corruption practices in human resource management in the public sector, Anti Corruption Resource Center. file:///C:/Users/RABBANI%201/Downloads/_publication_corruption-and-anti-corruption-practices-in-human-resource-management-in-the-public-sector.pdf
- Vuong, B., & Sid, S. (2020). The impact of human resource management practices on employee engagement and moderating role of gender and marital status: An evidence from the Vietnamese banking industry. *Management Science Letters*, 10(7), 1633-1648. <http://growingscience.com/beta/msl/3631-the-impact-of-human-resource-management-practices-on-employee-engagement-and-moderating-role-of-gender-and-marital-status-an-evidence-from-the-vietnamese-banking-industry.html>
- Winterberg, C. A., Brummel, B. J. Ayres, T. B., & Kerr, A. J. (2021). Applying ethical dilemmas to professional ethics training and education: Practical implications and future directions. *Industrial and Organizational Psychology*, 14(3), 325-330. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/iop.2021.73>. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/industrial-and-organizational-psychology/article/abs/applying-ethical-dilemmas-to-professional-ethics-training-and-education-practical-implications-and-future-directions/911DA226878E912A9FA9FDBD1CBF54F0>
- World Bank (2013), Hybrids and Contradictions: Human Resource Management in the Contemporary Public Sector. <http://espace.library.uq.edu.au/view/UQ:277249>
- Zubair, S. (2020). Talent Abuse: Challenges Turning Talent Management into Talent Abuse. *Governance and Management Review*, 5(2), 118-134. Retrieved October 7, 2022 from http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/IAS/PDF/6-v5_2_20.pdf